

**BOARD OF ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW
JUNE 11, 2021**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

AGENDA	pg 0001
ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS	
I.A.1. APRIL 23, 2021 MEETING MINUTES	pg 0008
NEW CONTESTED CASES	
IV.1. NOTICE OF APPEAL	pg 0014

BOARD OF ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW
JUNE 11, 2021
9:00 AM
DEQ ZOOM CONFERENCE

NOTE: Board members, the Board attorney, and secretary will be participating electronically. Interested persons, members of the public, and the media are welcome to attend via Zoom or telephonically. The Board will make reasonable accommodations for persons with disabilities who wish to participate in this meeting. Please contact the Board Secretary by e-mail at Regan.Sidner@mt.gov, no less than 24 hours prior to the meeting to advise her of the nature of the accommodation needed.

9:00 AM

I. ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. REVIEW AND APPROVE MINUTES

1. The Board will vote on adopting the April 23, 2021, meeting minutes.

Public Comment.

II. BRIEFING ITEMS

A. CONTESTED CASE UPDATES

1. Enforcement cases assigned to the Hearing Examiner
 - a. **In the matter of violations of the Water Quality Act by Reflections at Copper Ridge, LLC, at Reflections at Copper Ridge Subdivision, Billings, Yellowstone County (MTR105376), BER 2015-01 WQ and In the matter of violations of the Water Quality Act by Copper Ridge Development Corporation at Copper Ridge Subdivision, Billings, Yellowstone County (MTR105377), BER 2015-02 WQ.** On April 17, 2015, Copper Ridge Development Corporation and Reflections at Copper Ridge, LLC, filed a Notice of Appeal and Request for hearing with the Board.
 - i. **District Court Case:** This matter is before the District Court on judicial review following an intermediate agency ruling. DEQ began separate enforcement actions against Copper Ridge Development Corp. and Reflections at Copper Ridge, LLC, for violations of the Montana Water Quality Act. The enforcement actions were followed by separate administrative appeals. The cases were consolidated before a hearing examiner at Petitioners' request. Following an evidentiary ruling that would allow for the admission of certain photographs, Petitioners moved to separate the cases again because the evidence to be admitted pertained to only one Petitioner. The motion was denied. The hearing examiner also denied Petitioners' subsequent motion *in limine*. Petitioners then filed a petition for judicial review of the hearing examiner's intermediate rulings and named the Board and DEQ as Respondents. The Board filed a motion to dismiss on the grounds that it should not have been named in the petition since it was not a party to the underlying contested case hearing. The

motion was briefed and argued on October 7, 2020. On March 17, 2021, Judge Harada denied the Board's motion to dismiss. She determined that while the Board is not a required party, it may be named as a party on judicial review. She has not yet issued a decision on the underlying petition for judicial review.

- b. **In the matter of Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing by Westmoreland Resources, Inc. Regarding October 27, 2020 Notice of Violation and Administrative Compliance and Penalty Order, BER 2020-06 SM.** On November 25, 2020, the Board received a Notice of Appeal from Westmoreland Resources. At its December 2020 meeting, the Board assigned this case to former Hearing Examiner Sarah Clerget. The parties filed a Joint Motion for Stay on January 12, 2021 which was granted the same day. On January 20, 2021, Jeffrey Doud has taken responsibility for this matter as a Hearing Examiner. The parties filed a Joint Status Report on March 12, 2021 indicating that they are working toward settlement. The parties then, filed a second motion to extend the stay of the proceedings, seeking to extend the stay for 45-days. The parties have agreed that they are unlikely to negotiate a settlement by May 28, 2021. A Scheduling Order was issued on June 1, 2021 in which deadlines concerning discovery, expert witness disclosures and any dispositive motions were established.
 - c. **In the matter of the notice of appeal by Duane Murray regarding the notice of violations and administrative compliance and penalty order (Docket No. SUB-18-01; ES#36-93-L1-78; FID 2568), BER 2020-01 OC.** At its last meeting, the Board remanded this matter back to Hearing Examiner Lindsey Simon for further proceedings. On May 17, 2021, Hearing Examiner Simon issued an Order on Remand setting the remaining procedural deadlines in this case. The parties have until June 21, 2021 to file dispositive motions. If neither party files dispositive motions, the parties have until July 5, 2021 in which to file proposed hearing dates with Ms. Simon.
2. Non-enforcement cases assigned to the Hearings Examiner

 - a. **In the matter of the Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing by Alpine Pacific Utilities Regarding Issuance of MPDES Permit No. MTX000164, BER 2019-06 WQ.** At the Board's October 9, 2020 meeting it voted to adopt the parties Stipulation and Request for Retention of Board Jurisdiction. On May 3, 2021, the parties filed an update with Hearing Examiner Lindsey Simon stating that pursuant to the Stipulation, Alpine had submitted the monitoring well plan to DEQ, that DEQ has approved the monitoring well installation plan, and that the monitoring well has been installed. The parties will provide another update on August 2, 2021.
 - b. **In the matter of Westmoreland Resources, Inc.'s, appeal of final MPDES permit No. MT0021229 issued by DEQ for the Absaloka Mine in Hardin, Big Horn County, MT, BER 2015-06 WQ.** On September 25, 2015, Westmoreland Resources, Inc. filed a notice of appeal and request for hearing and former Hearing Examiner Sarah Clerget took responsibility for this matter as a hearing officer on September 8, 2017. The case was stayed pending a Montana Supreme Court decision, which was issued in September 2019. On April 24, 2020, the parties filed a Joint Motion for Stay indicating that they are working toward settlement of the case. That motion was granted on April 28, 2020, and the case was stayed until July 24, 2020. The parties filed a Joint Motion to

Continue Stay on July 24, 2020, and September 9, 2020, which was granted on July 29, 2020, and September 9, 2020. On September 30, 2020, the parties filed a “Joint Motion to Remand and Suspension of Proceedings.” The BER granted that Motion on October 9, 2020, and issued its Order granting remand on November 16, 2020. The parties are to file a joint status report to the BER no later than June 30, 2021. Hearing Examiner Simon took responsibility for this matter on January 15, 2021.

- c. **In the Matter of the Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing by Spring Creek Coal, LLC Regarding Issuance of MPDES Permit No. MT0024619, BER 2019-02 WQ.** On April 12, 2019, the BER appointed former Hearing Examiner Sarah Clerget to preside over this contested case. On May 8, 2020, the parties filed a Joint Motion to Substitute, requesting that Navajo Transitional Energy Company, LLC replace Spring Creek Coal as a party, as it had replaced Spring Creek Coal as the permit holder. The motion to substitute was granted on May 13, 2020, and an Amended Scheduling Order was issued on May 12, 2020. On January 21, 2021, Hearing Examiner Andrew Cziok took responsibility for this matter as a hearing officer of this contested case. The parties filed a Joint Motion for Remand of permit and Suspension of Proceedings on March 17, 2021. Hearing Examiner Cziok granted that Motion, and the parties will file a status report by June 30, 2021.
- d. **An appeal in the matter of amendment application AM3, Signal Peak Energy LLC’s Bull Mountain Coal Mine #1 Permit No. C1993017, BER 2016-07 SM.** On August 18, 2021 the parties participated in the contested case hearing. The parties filed their Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law on December 18, 2020. On January 21, 2021, Hearing Examiner Andrew Cziok took responsibility for this matter as a hearing officer of this contested case. As of March 31, 2021, Hearing Examiner Caitlin Buzzas has taken responsibility for this matter as a hearing officer. Ms. Buzzas is in the process of reviewing the record and will issue her Proposed Findings of Fact Conclusions of Law. On May 27, 2021, the Intervenor-Respondent signal Peak Energy, LLC submitted a *Request for the Board of Environmental Review to Reclaim Jurisdiction of Contested Case Proceeding*. On the morning of June 2, 2021, the Hearing Examiner held a Status Conference. All parties were present and gave input. The Hearing Examiner informed the parties that the FOFCOL had already been drafted and that a decision would be forthcoming in the very near future. The responding parties have been given up to June 14, 2021 to respond formally to the Intervenor -Respondent’s request. Upon complete briefing, the Hearing Examiner will issue an Order concerning disposition of the request.
- e. **In the Matter of the Notice of Appeal by the Rippling Woods Homeowners Association, et al., Regarding Approval of Opencut Mining Permit No. 2949, Moudy Pit Site, Ravalli County, MT, BER 2019-08 through 21 OC.** Between November 8, 2019, and November 29, 2019, the Board received fourteen appeals from various parties regarding the approval of Opencut Mining Permit No. 2949. On December 13, 2019, the Board consolidated for procedural purposes BER 2019-08 through 21 OC. Several parties were dismissed from the appeals and a Scheduling Order was issued on January 31, 2020. DEQ filed a Partial Motion for Summary Judgment on September 29, 2020. The remaining appellants filed a response on October 21, 2020, and DEQ filed a reply on November 4, 2020. Former Hearing Examiner Eckstein held Oral argument on DEQ’s Partial Motion for Summary Judgment on February 11, 2021. Hearing Examiner Snowberger issued a “Notice of Substitution” on March 12, 2021. On

April 12, 2021, Ms. Snowberger issued a Disclosure and Status Conference stating that she has a potential conflict and set a status conference for April 15, 2021. On April 15, 2021, the parties convened to discuss the disclosure and an Order was issued giving DEQ until April 22nd to determine its position. DEQ filed a Status Report on April 22, 2021, Ms. Snowberger issued a Notice of Recusal on May 13, 2021, and Hearing Examiner Caitlin Buzzas issued a Notice of Substitution that same day. Hearing Examiner Buzzas is reviewing the file and will issue a decision on DEQ's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment.

- f. **In the Matter of Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing by Western Energy Company Regarding Approval of Surface Mining Permit No. C2011003F, BER 2019-05 OC.** On May 31, 2019, the BER appointed former Hearing Examiner Sarah Clerget to preside over the contested case for procedural purposes only. At the Board's August meeting, it voted to assign the case in its entirety to Ms. Clerget. The parties cross moved for partial summary judgment, and Westmoreland also filed a Motion to Dismiss. On November 24, 2020, Ms. Clerget issued an order denying Westmoreland's Motion to Dismiss, denying Conservation Groups' Motion for Partial Summary Judgment, and granting Westmoreland's and DEQ's Motions for Partial Summary Judgment. Ms. Clerget held a status conference on December 4, 2020, at which all parties could not agree to bring the motions decision before the Board. Therefore, the case will proceed to a hearing on the one remaining issue. Former Hearing Examiner Clerget issued an Amended Scheduling Order on January 14, 2021. Hearing Examiner Jeffrey Doud has taken responsibility for this matter as a hearing officer as of January 20, 2021. A hearing began on June 2, 2021.
- g. **Montana Environmental Information Center, and Sierra Club v. Montana Department of Environmental Quality, Montana Board of Environmental Review, and Western Energy Co. (DV-2019-34, Rosebud County) (District Court).** In July 2019, MEIC and the Sierra Club filed a petition for judicial review of BER's decision to approve a permit to expand the Rosebud Mine. The Board filed a motion to dismiss on the grounds that it should not have been named in the petition since it was the deciding agency, not a party to the underlying contested case proceeding. Judge Bidegaray denied the motion on March 12, 2020. The Montana Supreme Court denied the Board's petition for writ of supervisory control to have the Order reviewed before the case was fully decided by the District Court and remanded the case.

The petition for judicial review has been fully briefed, and the parties presented oral argument on December 16, 2020. Petitioners recently submitted supplemental authority, and the Respondents (other than BER) responded. The matter has been fully submitted, and the Board is just waiting for a decision from Judge Bidegaray. Once a decision is issued, the Board will need to discuss how to proceed at that time.

- h. **In the Matter of Notice of Appeal by Signal Peak Energy LLC, Regarding Purporting to Rule on An Alleged Impairment of Water Rights Permit No. C1993017, Roundup, Musselshell County, MT, BER 2020-04 SM.** On October 9, 2020, the BER appointed former Hearing Examiner Sarah Clerget to preside over this contest case hearing. On November 10, 2020, Ms. Clerget issued a Prehearing Order. The parties filed a Stipulation to Stay Proceedings on November 13, 2020. Ms. Clerget stayed the proceedings on November 20, 2020. Hearing Examiner Andrew Cziok took responsibility for this matter as a

hearing officer on January 21, 2021. On February 11, 2021, the parties filed a Stipulated Motion to Extend Stay of Proceedings Pending Settlement Negotiations. Mr. Cziok issued an Order granting the stay on February 12, 2021. The parties filed a Joint Stipulation for Dismissal on May 14, 2021. On May 27, 2021, Hearing Examiner Cziok issued an Order dismissing this case with prejudice pending the District Court's final disposition of the SPE District Court Appeal and final resolution of any appeals from the District Court's final disposition.

- i. **In the Matter of the Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing by City of Great Falls Regarding Issuance of MPDES Permit No. MT0021920, BER 2019-07 WQ.** On November 25, 2020, DEQ and the City of Great Falls filed a "Stipulation for Final Agency Decision". At its December 2020 meeting, the Board approved the Stipulation and on January 5, 2021 issued a "Board Order for Final Agency Decision" resolving appeal issues No. 1, 3, 4, and 5.
- j. **In the matter of the Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing Regarding DEQ's Issuance of a Final Section 401 Water Quality Certification #MT4011079 to Transcanada Keystone Pipeline LP for the Keystone XL Pipeline Project, BER 2021-01 WQ.** On January 4, 2021, the Northern Plains Resource Council and Sierra Club filed a "Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing." At its February 2021 meeting the Board appointed Agency Legal Services as Hearing Examiner of this contested case. Katherine Orr was assigned as Hearing Examiner of this matter and on March 9, 2021, she issued an Order to Set Scheduling Conference. The scheduling conference was held on March 15, 2021, and the parties agreed to stay this matter until further indication the case should go forward pursuant to decisions made by the Federal government regarding the Keystone XL Pipeline Project. A Status Conference was held on April 20, 2021, with both parties being represented by counsel. Parties agreed to continue the stay of this matter and set another Status Conference for July 12, 2021.
- k. **In the Matter Indigenous Environmental Network's and North Coast Rivers Alliance's Appeal of the Montana Department of Environmental Quality's Final Determination to Issue a 401 Water Quality Certification for the Keystone XL Pipeline, DEQ Application No. MT4011079, BER 2021-02 WQ.** On February 1, 2021, the Indigenous Environmental Network and North Coast Rivers Alliance filed a "Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing." At its February 2021 meeting the Board appointed Agency Legal Services as Hearing Examiner of this contested case. Katherine Orr was assigned as Hearing Examiner of this matter and on March 9, 2021, she issued an Order to Set Scheduling Conference. The scheduling conference was held on March 15, 2021, and the parties agreed to stay this matter until further indication the case should go forward pursuant to decisions made by the Federal government regarding the Keystone XL Pipeline Project. A Status Conference was held on April 20, 2021, with both parties being represented by counsel. Parties agreed to continue the stay of this matter and set another Status Conference for July 12, 2021.
- l. **In the Matter of Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing Regarding DEQ's Approval of Riverside Contracting, Inc.'s Opencut Mining Permit #3234 (Arrow Creek Site), BER 2020-08 OC.** On December 23, 2020, Appellants filed a "Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing." At its February 2021 meeting, the Board appointed Agency Legal Services as Hearing Examiner of

this contested case. On March 12, 2021, Hearing Examiner Cziok issued a Prehearing Order to the parties. Riverside Contracting filed a Petition to Intervene on March 25, 2021. DEQ and the Appellants filed a Joint Proposed Schedule on March 26, 2021, the Petition to Intervene and the Proposed Schedule were granted on April 1, 2021. The parties are proceeding according to the Scheduling Order with discovery closing December 2021.

- m. **In the Matter of Contest and Request for Hearing by Talen Montana, LLC Regarding the Selection of a Remedy and Setting of Financial Assurance for the Colstrip Steam Electric Station Units 1 & 2 by the Montana Department of Environmental Quality, BER 2020-07 MFSA/WQA.** On December 17, 2020, Talen Montana LLC filed a Request for Hearing and Protective Notice of Contest. The parties requested the proceeding be stayed pending completion of dispute resolution. That request was granted by former Board Chair Deveny on December 18, 2020. Katherine Orr was assigned as Hearing Examiner for this matter and issued an Order to Set Scheduling Conference on March 9, 2021. The parties filed a Joint Request to Continue Stay of BER Proceedings on March 18, 2021. Ms. Orr signed an Order Continuing Stay and Delaying Scheduling Conference Until Expiration of Stay Order on March 19, 2021. This matter will be stayed until DEQ Director's final decision following dispute resolution. This matter continues to be stayed pending DEQ Director's final decision.
 - n. **In the matter of notice of appeal and request for hearing by the Western Sugar Cooperative regarding its Montana Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permit No. MT0000281 issued October 29, 2020, BER 2020-05 WQ.** On November 24, 2020, the Board received a Notice of Appeal from Western Sugar Cooperative. At its December meeting, the Board assigned this matter to former Hearing Examiner Clerget. Ms. Clerget issued a Prehearing Order on January 4, 2021. Hearing Examiner Andrew Cziok took responsibility for this matter as a hearing officer on January 21, 2021. Mr. Cziok issued a Scheduling Order on March 16, 2021 and the parties are proceeding according to that order with discovery closing in January 2022.
3. Contested Cases not assigned to a Hearing Examiner and proceeding in District Court
- a. **In the matter of the notice of appeal and request for hearing by Western Energy Company (WECO) regarding its MPDES Permit No. MT0023965 issued for WECO's Rosebud Mine in Colstrip, BER 2012-12 WQ.** This matter has been stayed pending resolution of Montana Environmental Information Center and Sierra Club v. Montana DEQ and Western Energy Company (now on remand to the First Judicial District Court as Cause No. CDV 2012-1075). On September 10, 2019, the Montana Supreme Court reversed the First Judicial District Court on decisions of law and determined that DEQ properly interpreted rules implementing the Montana Water Quality Act (specifically ARM 17.30.637(4)). The Court recognized that DEQ has the flexibility to exempt ephemeral waters from certain water quality standards applicable to Class C-3 waters without BER reclassifying the waters. The Court also determined that DEQ lawfully permitted representative sampling of outfalls under Western Energy Company's MPDES permit. The Montana Supreme Court remanded the case back to the District Court for further proceedings to determine certain issues of material fact, specifically whether DEQ acted properly regarding a stretch of East Fork Armells Creek that is potentially

impaired and intermittent, whether it is necessary for DEQ to adopt a TMDL for impaired segments of East Fork Armells Creek, and whether the representative monitoring selected by DEQ is factually supported. The parties are currently proceeding under a scheduling order and have fully briefed pretrial motions.

III. ACTION ITEMS

None.

IV. NEW CONTESTED CASES

1. **In the matter of the request for appeal and hearing of the permit revocation order for the Lucy Sandbox Gravel Pit (Permit # 2328, Lucy's Sandbox Gravel Pit, Richland County, MT), BER 2021-03 OC.** On May 17, 2021, the Board received a request for hearing. (See Board Packet.) The Board can decide to assign a hearings examiner for limited purposes such as to handle procedural matters and/or prehearing matters up to the stage of final disposition or with a full delegation of authority to adjudicate the case to the stage of issuing a recommended final decision. The Board may also decide to retain responsibility for full adjudication of the matter.

V. BOARD COUNSEL UPDATE

Counsel for the Board will report on rulemaking by the Board, general Board business, procedural matters, handling of case assignments when a hearing examiner departs and other matters that the Board wishes to address.

VI. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

Under this item, members of the public may comment on any public matter within the jurisdiction of the Board that is not otherwise on the agenda for the meeting. Individual contested case proceedings are not public matters on which the public may comment.

VII. ADJOURNMENT



**BOARD OF ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW
MEETING MINUTES**

APRIL 23, 2021

Call to Order

Chairperson Ruffatto called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

Attendance

Board Members Present

By Zoom: Chairman Ruffatto; Board Members Hillary Hanson, David Lehnerr, David Simpson, Jon Reiten, Julia Altemus, and Joseph Smith

A quorum of the Board was present.

Board Attorney(s) Present

Katherine Orr, Attorney General's Office, Department of Justice

DEQ Personnel Present

Board Liaison: George Mathieus

Board Secretary: Regan Sidner, Joyce Wittenberg (*interim*)

DEQ Legal: Angie Colamaria, Kirsten Bowers, Aaron Pettis, Kurt Moser, Mark Lucas, Nick Whitaker, Sarah Clerget, Catherine Armstrong

Water Protection: Daryl Barton

Enforcement: Margarite Juarez Thomas

Coal & Opencut: Chris Cronin

Other Parties Present

Laurie Crutcher, Laurie Crutcher Court Reporting

Vicki Marquis, Holland & Hart - representing Copper Ridge Development and Reflections at Copper Ridge, LLC

Catherine Laughner - representing Western Sugar Cooperative

Andrew Cziok, Michele Snowberger, Linsey Simon, Caitlin Buzzas, Jeffrey Doud - Montana DOJ Agency Legal Services Bureau

I. ADMINISTRATIVE MATERIALS

A. REVIEW AND APPROVE MINUTES

I.A.1. The Board will vote on adopting the December 11, 2020 meeting Minutes

There was no board discussion and no public comment.

Board member Hanson moved to approve the December 11, 2020, meeting minutes; Board Member Lehnherr seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

I.A.2. The Board will vote on adopting the February 26, 2021 meeting Minutes

There was no board discussion and no public comment.

Board member Simpson moved to approve the February 26, 2021 meeting minutes; Chair Ruffatto seconded. The motion passed unanimously.

I.B. Introduction of Hearing Officers from Agency Legal Services and Contracted Counsel

Ms. Orr introduced each of the Hearing Officers from Agency Legal Services and allowed them to briefly introduce themselves. Ms. Orr introduced Amy Christiansen, Contracted Counsel, who was not present at the meeting.

1.C. Discussion of Preference for Cases to be Assigned to Hearing Officers for Judicial Decision Making to be made by the Board

Ms. Orr explained the process for and reasons why the Board could decide to delegate adjudication to a Hearings Officer, partially or fully, and the due diligence required of the Board if a case is or is not assigned to a Hearing Officer.

1.D. Discussion of Disclosure of Board Members' Contact Information

Chair Ruffatto moved that Board Member contact information not be published online and that the website contain a statement that all communication to BER Board Members go through the Board's Secretary. Board Member Lehnherr seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

There was no public comment.

II. BRIEFING ITEMS

A. CONTESTED CASE UPDATES

Chair Ruffatto asked the Hearing Officer of each case for updates to the brief in the agenda, and provided an opportunity for Board Members to ask questions.

II.A.1.a. In the matter of violations of the Water Quality Act by Reflections at Copper Ridge, LLC, at Reflections at Copper Ridge Subdivision, Billings, Yellowstone County (MTR105376), BER 2015-01 WQ and In the matter of violations of the Water Quality Act by Copper Ridge Development Corporation at Copper Ridge Subdivision, Billings, Yellowstone County (MTR105377), BER 2015-02 WQ.

Board Member Simpson asked why there is a parallel case in District Court when the case has not cleared the BER. Ms. Orr explained that it is an interlocutory appeal.

- II.A.1.b. **In the matter of Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing by Westmoreland Resources, Inc. Regarding October 27, 2020 Notice of Violation and Administrative Compliance and Penalty Order, BER 2020-06 SM.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.a. **In the matter of the Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing by Alpine Pacific Utilities Regarding Issuance of MPDES Permit No. MTX000164, BER 2019-06 WQ.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.b. **In the matter of Westmoreland Resources, Inc.'s, appeal of final MPDES permit No. MT0021229 issued by DEQ for the Absaloka Mine in Hardin, Big Horn County, MT, BER 2015-06 WQ.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.c. **In the matter of the notice of appeal and request for hearing by Montanore Minerals Corporation Regarding Issuance of MPDES Permit No. MT0030279, Libby, Montana, BER2017-03 WQ.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.d. **In the Matter of the Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing by Spring Creek Coal, LLC Regarding Issuance of MPDES Permit No. MT0024619, BER 2019-02 WQ.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.e. **An appeal in the matter of amendment application AM3, Signal Peak Energy LLC's Bull Mountain Coal Mine #1 Permit No. C1993017, BER 2016-07 SM.**
- This case was transferred to Hearing Officer Caitlin Buzzas. There were no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.f. **In the Matter of the Notice of Appeal by the Rippling Woods Homeowners Association, et al., Regarding Approval of Opencut Mining Permit No. 2949, Moudy Pit Site, Ravalli County, MT, BER 2019-08 through 21 OC.**
- Hearing Officers Michele Snowberger disclosed a potential conflict that she may have, which is currently under review. There were no questions from the Board Members.

- II.A.2.g. **In the Matter of Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing by Western Energy Company Regarding Approval of Surface Mining Permit No. C2011003F, BER 2019-03 OC and BER 2019-05 OC.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.h. **Montana Environmental Information Center, and Sierra Club v. Montana Department of Environmental Quality, Montana Board of Environmental Review, and Western Energy Co. (DV-2019-34, Rosebud County) (District Court).**
- No update was provided for this case.
- II.A.2.i. **In the Matter of Notice of Appeal by Nicholas and Janet Savko, Regarding Floodplain Setbacks, Gallatin County, MT, BER 2020-03 SUB.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.j. **In the Matter of Notice of Appeal by Signal Peak Energy LLC, Regarding Purporting to Rule on An Alleged Impairment of Water Rights Permit No. C1993017, Roundup, Musselshell County, MT, BER 2020-04 SM.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.k. **In the Matter of Notice of Appeal by Woodrock, Inc., Regarding Permit Suspension Order of Opencut Mining Permit No. 2677, Stipek Site, Dawson County, MT, BER 2020-02 OC.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.l. **In the Matter of the Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing by City of Great Falls Regarding Issuance of MPDES Permit No. MT0021920, BER 2019-07 WQ.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.m. **In the matter of the Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing Regarding DEQ's Issuance of a Final Section 401 Water Quality Certification #MT4011079 to Transcanada Keystone Pipeline LP for the Keystone XL Pipeline Project, BER 2021-01 WQ.**
- II.A.2.n. **In the Matter Indigenous Environmental Network's and North Coast Rivers Alliance's Appeal of the Montana Department of Environmental Quality's Final Determination to Issue a 401 Water Quality Certification for the Keystone XL Pipeline, DEQ Application No. MT4011079, BER 2021-02 WQ.**
- Hearing Officer Orr reported that the status conference for this matter and the previous, which had been scheduled for the week prior to the Board meeting, has been stayed pending activities by the Federal Government regarding the Keystone permits.

- II.A.2.o. **In the Matter of Notice of Appeal and Request for Hearing Regarding DEQ's Approval of Riverside Contracting, Inc.'s Opencut Mining Permit #3234 (Arrow Creek Site), BER 2020-08 OC.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.p. **In the Matter of Contest and Request for Hearing by Talen Montana, LLC Regarding the Selection of a Remedy and Setting of Financial Assurance for the Colstrip Steam Electric Station Units 1 & 2 by the Montana Department of Environmental Quality, BER 2020-07 MFSA/WQA.**
- Hearing Officer Orr reported that the stay from December is still in effect. There were no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.2.q. **In the matter of notice of appeal and request for hearing by the Western Sugar Cooperative regarding its Montana Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Permit No. MT0000281 issued October 29, 2020, BER 2020-05 WQ.**
- There were no additions from the Hearing Officer and no questions from the Board Members.
- II.A.3.a. **In the matter of the notice of appeal and request for hearing by Western Energy Company (WECO) regarding its MPDES Permit No. MT0023965 issued for WECO's Rosebud Mine in Colstrip, BER 2012-12 WQ**
- Ms. Bowers reported that the case is in front of District Court on a remand from the Supreme Court with action pending, expected in early May. The process before the Board is stayed pending the completion of the District Court case.

III. ACTION ITEMS

A. ACTION ON CONTESTED CASES

- III.A.1. **In the matter of violations of the Water Quality Act by Reflections at Copper Ridge, LLC, at Reflections at Copper Ridge Subdivision, Billings, Yellowstone County (MTR105376), BER 2015-01 WQ and In the matter of violations of the Water Quality Act by Copper Ridge Development Corporation at Copper Ridge Subdivision, Billings, Yellowstone County (MTR105377), BER 2015-02 WQ.**
- The Board heard oral argument from Vicki Marquis of Holland and Hart, representing Reflections at Copper Ridge, LLC, and Kirsten Bowers of DEQ.
- Board Member Simpson moved that the Board concludes that the Hearing Examiner complied with the Board's remand order, that the four excluded photographs were considered by the Hearing Examiner, and that DEQ was given the opportunity and failed to present additional evidence relating to the four excluded photographs. Board Member Reiten seconded the motion. The motion passed four to one, with Board Member Lehnherr dissenting.
- Board Member Simpson moved to accept the Hearing Examiner's Finding of Facts and Conclusions of Law and order; Board Member Smith seconded. The motion passed four to one, with Board Member Lehnherr dissenting.
- Ms. Orr will complete a summary write-up on behalf of the Board and submit it to Chair Ruffatto for approval.

III.A.2. | **In the matter of the notice of appeal by Duane Murray regarding the notice of violations and administrative compliance and penalty order (Docket No. SUB-18-01; ES#36-93-L1-78; FID 2568), BER 2020-01 OC.**

Mr. Murray was not present or represented at the meeting.

Board Member Lehnherr moved to approve the dismissal of the appeal recommended by the Hearing Examiner; Boarded Member Reiten seconded. The motion failed one to four with Chair Ruffatto and Board Members Simpson, Reiten, and Smith dissenting.

Chair Ruffatto moved that the appeal be remanded to the Hearing Examiner; Board Member Simpson seconded. The motion passed by four to one with Board Member Lehnherr dissenting.

IV. **BOARD COUNSEL UPDATE**

| Ms. Orr gave an update to the Board on Senate Bill 233, which has cleared the Legislature and is waiting to be ratified by the Governor. The Bill removes rulemaking responsibility and authority from the BER. The Board will continue to maintain quasi-judicial authority. Ms. Orr will research how this Bill will impact the Board's ability to initiate rules with respect to its own procedures before the June 11, 2021, Board meeting.

V. **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

| No public comment was offered.

VI. **ADJOURNMENT**

| Chair Ruffatto moved to adjourn; Board Member Reiten seconded. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 1:19 PM.

Board of Environmental Review April 23, 2021, minutes approved:

STEVEN RUFFATTO
CHAIRMAN
BOARD OF ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

DATE



Board of Environmental Review

Memo

TO: Katherine Orr, Board Attorney
Board of Environmental Review

FROM: Regan Sidner, Board Secretary
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

DATE: May 17, 2021

SUBJECT: Board of Environmental Review Case No. BER 2021-03 OC

BEFORE THE BOARD OF ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW
OF THE STATE OF MONTANA

IN THE MATTER OF: THE REQUEST FOR
APPEAL AND HEARING OF THE PERMIT
REVOCATION ORDER FOR THE LUCY
SANDBOX GRAVEL PIT (PERMIT #2328,
LUCY'S SANDBOX GRAVEL PIT, RICHLAND
COUNTY, MT) .

Case No. BER 2021-03 OC

On May 17, 2021, the BER received the attached request for hearing via email. Please serve copies of pleadings and correspondence on me and on the following DEQ representatives in this case.

Sarah Clerget
Legal Counsel
Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901
Sarah.Clerget@mt.gov

Ed Hayes, Bureau Chief
Cole and Opencut Mining Bureau
Department of Environmental Quality
P.O. Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901
ehayes@mt.gov

Attachments

May 11, 2021

CERTIFIED MAIL

Ms. Leea Anderson
Environmental Enforcement Specialist
Montana Department of Environmental Quality
PO Box 200901
Helena, MT 59620-0901

Re: Request for Hearing, Permit Revocation Order
Permit #2328, Lucy's Sandbox Gravel Pit, Richland, Co., MT

Dear Leea,

Pursuant to the following, we officially request a hearing to appeal and mitigate all issues pertaining to Lucy's Sandbox.

The Permit Revocation Order indicates "Hunter may appeal this Permit Revocation Order and request a hearing before the Board of Environmental Review (Board) by submitting a written request stating the reason for the request to the board within 30 days after service of the order." Since "Service of an order by mail is complete 3 business days after mailing" the deadline could be 33 days from April 13, 2021. However, upon reviewing the tracking information from USPS, the Permit Revocation Order did not arrive and available for pick up and therefore served until April 17, 2021. Based on this information, the deadline for appealing the Permit Revocation Order is Monday, May 17, 2021.

The Permit Revocation Order is ONLY for the Lucy's Sandbox pit and is unrelated to issues and bond forfeiture at the Stickville Pit. The landowner of the Lucy's Sandbox Pit is currently listed as RKT, LLC. The Registered Agent of RKT, LLC is Gordon Torgerson.

DEQ is willing to work with Hunter Light to set up a Zoom meeting to discuss the issue. Please let us know what dates and times work for you and whom will be in attendance.

We would first like to request a Zoom meeting whereby the parties including but not limited to; DEQ's (Leea Anderson, Mark Lucas), Gordon Torgerson, and Neil Amondson could participate. This meeting will occur within next 10 days or no later than before end of the month upon confirming available schedules for all involved. Since Mr. Torgerson and Neil Amondson's availability is more easily modified, please provide 2-3 times that work for your DEQ representatives.

Our reasons for requesting the hearing are based on the following events and interim correspondence (mail, phone conversations) between Leea Anderson and Gordon Torgerson.

- Mining operations ceased in 2016 and all mining equipment was removed at that time.
- The pit was reclaimed in October of 2017 and reseeded in November of 2017 at the expense of the landowner (RKT, LLC).
- There are stockpiles of sand and gravel in the pit that the landowner owns. A request to release the bond was sent to the DEQ in early March of 2018.

Regards,

Neil Amondson, formerly Hunter Light-ND, LLC
NAmondson@icloud.com C 701.580.5884

CC: Gorgon Torgerson
Mark Lucas, DEQ
Ed Coleman, DEQ